

The logo for the Citizens Budget Commission features the text "CITIZENS • BUDGET • COMMISSION" in a bold, black, sans-serif font. The text is centered and overlaid on a background of several light blue rectangular blocks of varying heights and widths, arranged in a staggered, horizontal pattern.

CITIZENS • BUDGET • COMMISSION

Contact:

Charles Brecher
212-279-2605, ext. 315

Jamison Dague
212-279-2605, ext. 338

CBC EXAMINES WHY THE MTA'S SUBWAY STATIONS NEVER REACH A STATE OF GOOD REPAIR AND WHAT CAN BE DONE ABOUT IT

**Interactive Map Accompanying Report Shows Conditions at Each Subway Station;
7 of the 10 Worst Stations Are In Queens**

New York, NY – September 2, 2015 – The Citizens Budget Commission (CBC) today released a report – titled “Sisyphus and Subway Stations” – that examines why the subway stations of the Metropolitan Transportation Authority (MTA) never reach a state of good repair and recommends how to address the challenge.

The MTA assesses the condition of its 467 subway stations using a “components” approach that identifies and rates two categories of components at each station: architectural (relating to appearance, such as tiles and painting) and structural (relating to functionality, such stairs and platform edges). The structural components are especially critical to safety and performance; they are rated from 1 to 5 with scores above 3.0 indicating repairs are needed to bring the component to a state of good repair. After completion of work authorized in the 2010-2014 capital plan, 3,195 structural components – more than one of every five – will still not have reached a state of good repair.

The report identifies the 33 stations in worst condition; they have more than half of their structural components not in a state of good repair. About half (16) of the 33 stations are in Queens, including 7 of the 10 worst stations.

An interactive map accompanies the report and enables New Yorkers to see the condition of each subway station in the system. By clicking on any station on the map, a viewer can learn what percentage of (and how many) structural components are not in a state of good repair. The interactive map reveals that 76 stations are in a state of good repair including 41 in Brooklyn, 14 each in Manhattan and the Bronx, and 7 in Queens.

The prospects for bringing all stations to a state of good repair are dim, even if the MTA's proposed capital plan for 2015-2019 is fully funded. The current pace of work brings 280 components per year to a state of good repair; given the backlog and rate at which components depreciate and become in need of work, it is unclear when all stations will reach a state of good repair.

Founded in 1932, the Citizens Budget Commission is a nonpartisan, nonprofit civic organization devoted to influencing constructive change in the finances and services of New York City and New York State governments.

The logo for the Citizens Budget Commission features the text "CITIZENS • BUDGET • COMMISSION" in a bold, black, sans-serif font. The text is centered and overlaid on a background of seven light blue rectangular blocks of varying heights and widths, arranged in a staggered, horizontal pattern.

CITIZENS • BUDGET • COMMISSION

To accelerate the pace for achieving a state of good repair for all stations, CBC recommends:

Prioritize State of Good Repair Work. Diverting some of the new expansion project funds in the proposed 2015-2019 capital plan to state of good repair work would significantly speed the pace. Shifting funds allocated for the next phase of the Second Avenue subway to station investments would cover 85 percent of the cost to bring all stations to a state of good repair in 30 years.

Improve Project Management. More could be accomplished if projects were better managed to avoid cost overruns. Of the 42 station rehabilitations and renewals completed between November 2010 and January 2014, 28 incurred cost increases, including 10 that more than doubled. Improving project management could yield significant sums to redeploy to other station work.

Make Effective Use of Public-Private Partnerships. Increased use of public-private partnerships can inject private-sector capital and expertise to enhance progress toward a state of good repair. While the MTA already uses some forms of public-private partnerships, others are promising. One model might borrow from the example set by the New York City Department of Parks and Recreation in establishing parks conservancies; as nonprofit organizations such “station conservancies” could marshal resources to rehabilitate and maintain stations on an ongoing basis. Appropriate governance and regulation of these conservancies is required to avoid abuses and inequities among neighborhoods, but they can yield significant public benefits. Another model would assign to a private firm or consortium responsibility for financing and implementing capital work and maintaining those stations over their expected useful life. The entity would also be given a right to pursue revenues from stations from concessions and advertising and contractual availability payments from the MTA.

“The MTA should have a credible plan to reach a state of good repair in all of our subway stations,” said CBC President Carol Kellermann. “It’s time to think more creatively about how to achieve that.”

The full report is available at www.cbcny.org.

The interactive map is available at <http://interactive.cbcny.org/nvct-station-conditions>.

CITIZENS • BUDGET • COMMISSION

Table 2: New York City Subway Stations With More than Half of Total Structural Components Not In State of Good Repair

Station Name	Borough	Trains Served	Structural Components	Not in SGR	
				Number	Share
52 St	Queens	7	29	23	79%
85 St-Forest Pkwy	Queens	J	19	14	74%
175 St	Manhattan	A	41	30	73%
30 Av	Queens	N Q	25	18	72%
103 St-Corona Plaza	Queens	7	25	17	68%
Borough Hall	Brooklyn	2 3	37	25	68%
36 Av	Queens	N Q	24	16	67%
Woodhaven Blvd	Queens	J Z	27	18	67%
Cypress Hills	Brooklyn	J	24	16	67%
7 Av	Brooklyn	B Q	21	14	67%
Astoria Blvd	Queens	N Q	32	21	66%
111 St	Queens	7	29	19	66%
138 St-Grand Concourse	Bronx	4 5	23	15	65%
Nostrand Av	Brooklyn	3	23	15	65%
155 St	Manhattan	E	45	29	64%
Woodside-61 St	Queens	7	28	18	64%
39 Av	Queens	N Q	22	14	64%
75 St-Elderts Ln	Queens	J Z	19	12	63%
Harlem-148 St	Manhattan	3	8	5	63%
President St	Brooklyn	2 3	26	16	62%
Graham Av	Brooklyn	L	25	15	60%
82 St-Jackson Hts	Queens	7	24	14	58%
Borough Hall	Brooklyn	4 5	33	19	58%
145 St	Manhattan	3	23	13	57%
Dyckman St	Manhattan	A	39	22	56%
Aqueduct Racetrack	Queens	A	9	5	56%
Broadway	Queens	N Q	22	12	55%
59 St	Brooklyn	R	37	20	54%
Prospect Av	Brooklyn	R	19	10	53%
69 St	Queens	7	23	12	52%
Winthrop	Brooklyn	5	29	15	52%
3 Av-138 St	Bronx	6	39	20	51%
Nevins St	Bronx	2 3 4 5	47	24	51%

Source: Data provided by Metropolitan Transportation Authority. "Stations Condition Survey" (August 2015).

Founded in 1932, the Citizens Budget Commission is a nonpartisan, nonprofit civic organization devoted to influencing constructive change in the finances and services of New York City and New York State governments.